# Beyond mean field theory for neural networks 

Michael Buice, Carson Chow



## $10^{11}$ neurons

## $10^{15}$ connections




Need to pick a

## $10^{11}$ neurons

 battleground

How do you get complex behavior (e.g. thinking) from the collective action of simple elements (e.g. point neurons)?

## Function vs Mechanism

How does the brain do $X$ ?

e.g. learning, memory, classification

How is $X$ generated in the brain?
e.g. oscillations, synchrony, persistent activity

## Neuron



## Neuron



$$
\begin{gathered}
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right) \\
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
\end{gathered}
$$

## Neuron



$$
\begin{gathered}
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right) \\
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
\end{gathered}
$$



## Network



$$
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right)
$$

$$
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
$$




## Network



$$
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right)
$$

$$
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
$$




$$
C \frac{d V_{i}}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{i}^{r}\right)\left(V_{i}-v_{r}\right)+\sum_{j=i}^{N} g_{i j} s_{j}(t)
$$

## Network



$$
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right)
$$

$$
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
$$




$$
C \frac{d V_{i}}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{i}^{r}\right)\left(V_{i}-v_{r}\right)+\sum_{j=i}^{N} g_{i j} s_{j}(t)
$$

## Network



$$
C \frac{d V}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{r}\right)\left(V-v_{r}\right)
$$

$$
\tau_{r} \frac{d x_{r}}{d t}=f(x, V)-x_{r}
$$




$$
C \frac{d V_{i}}{d t}=-\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}\left(x_{i}^{r}\right)\left(V_{i}-v_{r}\right)+\sum_{j=i}^{N} g_{i j} s_{j}(t)
$$

Really hard



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic


## 

## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## 

## mean field theory

## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic



## mean field theory

## Microscopic $\rightarrow$ Macroscopic

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 



# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

## Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation

## rate constant

$$
\searrow_{\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)}
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

## Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+\underset{\uparrow}{f}\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

gain function


# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

connection weights

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

# Activity equation Wilson-Cowan equation 

$$
\dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)
$$

purely phenomenological
Want to derive from neurons

## Brain as a map from inputs $I$ to outputs $a$



## Brain as a map from inputs $I$ to outputs $a$



## Brain as a map from inputs $I$ to outputs $a$



## Example learning rules

$\tau \dot{w}_{i j}=a_{i} a_{j}-w_{i j}$
Hebbian rule

## Example learning rules

$\tau \dot{w}_{i j}=a_{i} a_{j}-w_{i j}$
$\tau \dot{w}_{i j}=C_{i j}-w_{i j}$

Hebbian rule

Correlation rule

## Example learning rules

$\tau \dot{w}_{i j}=a_{i} a_{j}-w_{i j}$
$\tau \dot{w}_{i j}=C_{i j}-w_{i j}$

Hebbian rule

Correlation rule
but activity equations ignore correlations

## Correlations

## Poisson



Synchronized

time

## "Generalized" activity equations

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{a}_{i}(t)=-\alpha a_{i}(t)+f\left(\sum_{j} w_{i j} a_{j}(t)+I_{i}\right)+G\left[C_{i j}\right] \\
& \dot{C}_{i j}(t)=\psi\left[C_{i j}, a_{i}, a_{j}\right]
\end{aligned}
$$

Compute $C_{i j}$ from neurons

## Neuron phase models



## Neuron phase models




$$
\frac{d v}{d t}=I+v^{2} \quad \xrightarrow{v=\tan (\theta / 2)} \quad \frac{d \theta}{d t}=1-\cos \theta+I(1+\cos \theta)
$$

## Neuron phase models



$$
\frac{d v}{d t}=I+v^{2} \quad \longrightarrow \quad \frac{d \theta}{d t}=1-\cos \theta+I(1+\cos \theta)
$$

Quadratic integrate-and-fire

## Neuron phase models



$$
\frac{d v}{d t}=I+v^{2}
$$

$$
\longrightarrow \quad \frac{d \theta}{d t}=1-\cos \theta+I(1+\cos \theta)
$$

$$
v=\tan (\theta / 2)
$$

Quadratic
Theta model

## Neuron phase models




$$
\frac{d v}{d t}=I+v^{2}
$$

$$
\longrightarrow \quad \frac{d \theta}{d t}=1-\cos \theta+I(1+\cos \theta)
$$

$$
v=\tan (\theta / 2)
$$

Quadratic
Theta model
integrate-and-fire
$\underset{\text { model }}{\text { Simple phase }} \quad \frac{d \theta}{d t}=I$

## Neuron model with coupling

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\theta)+\alpha_{i} u(t) \\
\dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} w_{i j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

## Neuron model with coupling

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\theta)+\alpha_{i} u(t) \\
& \dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} w_{i j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right) \\
& \text { spike times of neuron } j
\end{aligned}
$$

## Neuron model with coupling

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\theta)+\alpha_{i} u(t) \\
\dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} w_{i j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

spike times of neuron $j$

Global coupling: $w_{\mathrm{ij}}=$ const

## Correlations from finite size effects



## Correlations from finite size effects



$$
C\left(t, t^{\prime}\right)=\left\langle(u(t)-\bar{u})\left(u\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Correlations from finite size effects



$$
C\left(t, t^{\prime}\right)=\left\langle(u(t)-\bar{u})\left(u\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Correlations from finite size effects



$$
C\left(t, t^{\prime}\right)=\left\langle(u(t)-\bar{u})\left(u\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Kinetic theory



Joule


Boltzmann

## Kinetic theory

Derive macroscopic equations from microscopic dynamics

## Kinetic theory

# Derive macroscopic equations from microscopic dynamics 

microscopic $\rightarrow$ probabilistic $\rightarrow$ activity

## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions



## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions



## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions

Different initial data,
 parameters

## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions

Different initial data,
 parameters

## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions

## Different initial data, parameters



## Probability density evolution in $N$ dimensions

Different initial data,


## Liouville formalism

$$
\dot{\theta_{i}}=f_{i}(\vec{\theta}, t) \quad \vec{\theta}=\left\{\theta_{1}, \theta_{2}, \ldots, \theta_{N}\right\}
$$

## Liouville formalism

$$
\dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\vec{\theta}, t) \quad \vec{\theta}=\left\{\theta_{1}, \theta_{2}, \ldots, \theta_{N}\right\}
$$

## Probability conservation

## Liouville formalism

$$
\dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\vec{\theta}, t) \quad \vec{\theta}=\left\{\theta_{1}, \theta_{2}, \ldots, \theta_{N}\right\}
$$

## Probability conservation

$$
\frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

## Liouville formalism

$$
\dot{\theta}_{i}=f_{i}(\vec{\theta}, t) \quad \vec{\theta}=\left\{\theta_{1}, \theta_{2}, \ldots, \theta_{N}\right\}
$$

## Probability conservation

$$
\frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

(Einstein summation convention)

## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize



## Marginalize

$$
P_{k}\left(\theta_{1}, \cdots, \theta_{k}\right)=\int \prod_{i=k+1}^{N} d \theta_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

## Marginalize

$$
P_{k}\left(\theta_{1}, \cdots, \theta_{k}\right)=\int \prod_{i=k+1}^{N} d \theta_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

## Exchangeability

## Marginalize

$$
P_{k}\left(\theta_{1}, \cdots, \theta_{k}\right)=\int \prod_{i=k+1}^{N} d \theta_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

Exchangeability

$$
P_{N}\left(\cdots, \theta_{i}, \cdots, \theta_{j}, \cdots\right)
$$

## Marginalize

$$
P_{k}\left(\theta_{1}, \cdots, \theta_{k}\right)=\int \prod_{i=k+1}^{N} d \theta_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

Exchangeability

$$
P_{N}\left(\cdots, \theta_{i}, \cdots, \theta_{j}, \cdots\right)
$$

## Marginalize

$$
P_{k}\left(\theta_{1}, \cdots, \theta_{k}\right)=\int \prod_{i=k+1}^{N} d \theta_{i} P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

Exchangeability

$$
P_{N}\left(\cdots, \theta_{i}, \cdots, \theta_{j}, \cdots\right)
$$

$$
P_{1}\left(\theta_{1}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta_{2}\right)=\cdots=P_{1}(\theta)
$$

$$
\frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i}(\vec{\theta}) P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

$$
\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d \theta_{i} \frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i}(\vec{\theta}) P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

$$
\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d \theta_{i} \frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i}(\vec{\theta}) P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

For pairwise interactions, e.g. $\quad f_{i}(\vec{\theta})=\sum_{j=1}^{N} f\left(\theta_{i}, \theta_{j}\right)$

$$
\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d \theta_{i} \frac{\partial P_{N}(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t}=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_{i}} f_{i}(\vec{\theta}) P_{N}(\vec{\theta})
$$

For pairwise interactions, e.g. $\quad f_{i}(\vec{\theta})=\sum_{j=1}^{N} f\left(\theta_{i}, \theta_{j}\right)$

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}=-N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$$
P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)+\frac{1}{N} C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$$
P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)+\frac{1}{N} C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)+\frac{1}{N} C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) \\
& \frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Finite size effects

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)+\frac{1}{N} C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) \\
& \frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Finite size effects
$\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=0$
Mean field theory

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)=P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)+\frac{1}{N} C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) \\
& \frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Finite size effects
$\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=0$
Mean field theory Vlasov equation

## BBGKY Hierarchy

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

## BBGKY Hierarchy

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$C_{2}$ depends on $C_{3}$ and so on

## BBGKY Hierarchy

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$C_{2}$ depends on $C_{3}$ and so on
$N$ coupled PDEs

## BBGKY Hierarchy

$$
\frac{\partial P_{1}(\theta)}{\partial t}+N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}\left(\theta^{\prime}\right) P_{1}(\theta)=-N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d \theta^{\prime} f_{i}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right) C_{2}\left(\theta, \theta^{\prime}\right)
$$

$C_{2}$ depends on $C_{3}$ and so on
$N$ coupled PDEs
Need to truncate

## Exploiting exchangeability

$$
P_{N}\left(\ldots, \theta_{i}, \ldots, \theta_{j}, \ldots\right)=P_{N}\left(\ldots, \theta_{j}, \ldots, \theta_{i}, \ldots\right)
$$

Neuron identity is unimportant


## Exploiting exchangeability

$$
P_{N}\left(\ldots, \theta_{i}, \ldots, \theta_{j}, \ldots\right)=P_{N}\left(\ldots, \theta_{j}, \ldots, \theta_{i}, \ldots\right)
$$

Neuron identity is unimportant

density

$$
\eta(\theta, u, t)=\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta\left(\theta-\theta_{i}(t)\right)
$$

## Apply to phase neuron model

Neuron dynamics:

$$
\dot{\theta}=I(t)+\alpha u(t)
$$

## Apply to phase neuron model

Neuron dynamics:

$$
\dot{\theta}=I(t)+\alpha u(t)
$$

Synaptic dynamics:

## Apply to phase neuron model

Neuron dynamics:

$$
\dot{\theta}=I(t)+\alpha u(t)
$$

Synaptic dynamics:
$\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta \nu$

## Apply to phase neuron model

Neuron dynamics: $\dot{\theta}=I(t)+\alpha u(t)$

Synaptic dynamics: $\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta \nu$

Firing rate:

## Apply to phase neuron model

Neuron dynamics:

$$
\dot{\theta}=I(t)+\alpha u(t)
$$

Synaptic dynamics:

$$
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta \nu
$$

Firing rate:

$$
\nu=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)
$$

Firing rate: $\quad \nu=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)$ density:

$$
\eta(\theta, u, t)=\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta\left(\theta-\theta_{i}(t)\right)
$$

Firing rate: $\quad \nu=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { density: } \quad \eta(\theta, u, t)=\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta\left(\theta-\theta_{i}(t)\right) \\
& \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)=\dot{\theta} \delta(\pi-\theta(t))
\end{aligned}
$$

Firing rate: $\quad \nu=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)$
density: $\quad \eta(\theta, u, t)=\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta\left(\theta-\theta_{i}(t)\right)$

$$
\delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)=\dot{\theta} \delta(\pi-\theta(t))
$$

$$
\nu(t)=\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i} \dot{\theta}_{i}(t) \delta\left(\pi-\theta_{i}(t)\right)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t)
$$

# Klimontovich formalism 

e.g. Hildebrand, Buice, Chow, PRL 98.054IOI, 2007

Complete description of system

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
& \dot{u}+\beta u=\beta \nu \\
& \nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t)
\end{aligned}
$$

# Klimontovich formalism 

e.g. Hildebrand, Buice, Chow, PRL 98.054IOI, 2007

Complete description of system
$\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0$
$\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta \nu$
$\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t)$
but $\eta$ is not differentiable

## Average over initial data



# smooth by averaging 

## Average over initial data



# smooth by averaging 

## Average over initial data



# smooth by averaging 

## Average over initial data



# smooth by averaging 

## Average over initial data



# smooth by averaging 

## Average over initial data



smooth by averaging

Average over initial data


Average over initial data

smooth by
averaging

## Average over initial data


smooth by averaging

## $\theta$

$$
\rho(\theta, t)=\langle\eta(\theta, t)\rangle
$$

## Average over initial data


smooth by averaging

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \rho(\theta, t)=\langle\eta(\theta, t)\rangle \\
& u_{0}=\langle u\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

# Average over initial data 

$$
\dot{u}(t)=-\beta u(t)+\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\langle\dot{u}(t)=-\beta u(t)+\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\rangle
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

# Average over initial data 

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]=0
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\left\langle\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]=0\right\rangle
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0
$$

$$
\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0
$$

$$
\eta\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]
$$

$$
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0
$$

$$
\left\langle\eta\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0\right\rangle
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle] \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0 \\
\left\langle\eta \left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta\left[I(t) \eta+\begin{array}{c}
\alpha u \eta])=0\rangle \\
\langle\eta u \eta\rangle
\end{array}\right.\right.\right.
\end{gathered}
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle] \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0 \\
\left\langle\eta\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0\right\rangle \\
\langle\eta u \eta\rangle
\end{gathered}
$$

## Average over initial data

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle] \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0 \\
\left\langle\eta\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0\right\rangle \\
\langle\eta u \eta\rangle
\end{gathered}
$$

BBGKY moment hierarchy

## Average over initial data

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle\rangle \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}[I(t) \rho+\alpha\langle u \eta\rangle]=0 \\
\left\langle\eta\left(\partial_{t} u(t)+\beta u(t)-\beta[I(t) \eta+\alpha u \eta]\right)=0\right\rangle \\
\langle\eta u \eta\rangle
\end{gathered}
$$

BBGKY moment hierarchy

$$
\langle u \eta\rangle=u_{0} \rho+\frac{1}{N} C_{u v}
$$

$$
\langle u \eta\rangle=u_{0} \rho+\frac{1}{\nu} \not \subset u v
$$

$$
\langle u \eta\rangle=u_{0} \rho+\frac{\searrow}{\nu} \not \subset u v
$$

## Ignore correlations

# Mean field theory 

$$
\langle u \eta\rangle=u_{0} \rho+\frac{\searrow}{\nu} \not \subset u v
$$

## Ignore correlations

## Mean field theory

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta \nu(t) \\
\nu(t)=\left(I(t)+\alpha u_{0}(t)\right) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}\left[\left(I(t)+\alpha u_{0}(t)\right) \rho\right]=0
\end{gathered}
$$

## Mean field theory

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}_{0}(t)=-\beta u_{0}(t)+\beta \nu(t) \\
\nu(t)=\left(I(t)+\alpha u_{0}(t)\right) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}\left[\left(I(t)+\alpha u_{0}(t)\right) \rho\right]=0
\end{gathered}
$$

Previous work went straight to mean field theory
e.g. Desai and Zwanzig, I978; Strogatz and Mirollo, 1990; Treves 1993; Abbott and Van Vreeswijk, 1993; ...

## Steady state

$$
\begin{aligned}
\dot{u}=-\beta u+\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) & =0 \\
\partial_{t} \rho=-\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \rho] & =0
\end{aligned}
$$

## Steady state

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{u}=-\beta u+\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)=0 \\
& \partial_{t} \rho=-\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \rho] \quad=0 \\
& \bar{\rho}=\frac{1}{2 \pi} \quad \quad \bar{u}=\frac{I}{2 \pi}\left(1-\frac{\alpha}{2 \pi}\right)^{-1}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Steady state

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{u}=-\beta u+\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)=0 \\
& \partial_{t} \rho=-\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \rho] \quad=0 \\
& \bar{\rho}=\frac{1}{2 \pi} \quad \bar{u}=\frac{I}{2 \pi}\left(1-\frac{\alpha}{2 \pi}\right)^{-1} \\
& \nu=(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) \\
& \left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t) \\
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho_{0}\left(\pi-I t-\alpha \int_{0}^{t} u(s) d s\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t) \\
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho_{0}\left(\pi-I t-\alpha \int_{0}^{t} u(s) d s\right) \\
\text { If } \rho_{0}=\frac{1}{2 \pi}
\end{gathered}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t) \\
\dot{u}+\beta u= \\
\text { If } \rho_{0}=\frac{1}{2 \pi}
\end{gathered}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) \\
\left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t) \\
\dot{u}+\beta u=F(I+\alpha u) \quad F(x)=\frac{\beta}{2 \pi} x \\
\text { If } \rho_{0}=\frac{1}{2 \pi}
\end{array}
$$

## Activity equation

$$
\dot{u}+\beta u=\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)
$$

$$
\left.\partial_{t} \rho+\partial_{\theta}(I+\alpha u(t)) \rho(\theta, t)\right)=\rho_{0}(\theta) \delta(t)
$$

$$
\dot{u}+\beta u=F(I+\alpha u)
$$

$$
F(x)=\frac{\beta}{2 \pi} x
$$

Wilson-Cowan equation If $\rho_{0}=\frac{1}{2 \pi}$

## Beyond mean field theory

Need a scheme to compute moments of $\eta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03। I I 8, 2007

## Liouville

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville



## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031 I I8, 2007

## Liouville



## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031 I I8, 2007

## Liouville



## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031। I 8,2007

## Liouville



## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville



Klimontovich


## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville



Klimontovich


## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville


$\theta_{1}$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville


$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

Liouville
$\theta_{N}$
$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

## Liouville


$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

Liouville

$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

Liouville

$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007


## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

Liouville

$\theta_{1}$

Klimontovich

$\theta$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007


## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007


Ensemble of initial data

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007


Ensemble of initial data

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007


Ensemble of initial data $\Rightarrow$ Ensemble of systems

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007


Ensemble of initial data

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007


Ensemble of initial data $\Rightarrow$ Density of densities

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

$$
\begin{aligned}
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta] & =0 \\
\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) & =0
\end{aligned}
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
& \dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
& \eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
& \dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
& \eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta) \quad u\left(t_{0}\right)=u_{0}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

$$
\left.\begin{array}{l}
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
\eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta) \quad u\left(t_{0}\right)=u_{0}
\end{array}\right\}
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007

$$
\left.\begin{array}{l}
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
\eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta) \quad u\left(t_{0}\right)=u_{0}
\end{array}\right\} \quad \mathcal{L}\left(u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right)=0
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I 8, 2007

$$
\left.\begin{array}{c}
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
\eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta) \quad u\left(t_{0}\right)=u_{0}
\end{array}\right\} \quad \mathcal{L}\left(u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right)=0
$$

## Density functional

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.03 I I I8, 2007

$$
\left.\begin{array}{c}
\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta]=0 \\
\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta(I+\alpha u) \eta(\pi, t)=0 \\
\eta\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)=\eta_{0}(\theta) \quad u\left(t_{0}\right)=u_{0}
\end{array}\right\} \quad \mathcal{L}\left(u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right)=0
$$

$$
P\left[u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right] \propto \delta[\mathcal{L}]
$$

Density of the density

$$
P\left[u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right]
$$

$\underline{\square} \quad u, \eta$

uncertainty in initial data

$$
P[u, \eta]=\int \mathcal{D} u_{0} \mathcal{D} \eta_{0} P\left[u, \eta \mid u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right] P\left[u_{0}, \eta_{0}\right]
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta(x) & =\int e^{i k x} d k \\
P[u, \eta] & =\delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} e^{-S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta(x) & =\int e^{i k x} d k \\
P[u, \eta] & =\delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} e^{-S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta(x) & =\int e^{i k x} d k \\
P[u, \eta] & =\delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} e^{-S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]}
\end{aligned}
$$

Path or functional integral

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta(x) & =\int e^{i k x} d k \\
P[u, \eta] & =\delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} e^{-S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Path or functional integral

$$
\begin{aligned}
& S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\eta}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \eta]\right) \\
& \quad+\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u] \eta(\pi, t))
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta(x) & =\int e^{i k x} d k \\
P[u, \eta] & =\delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} e^{-S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]}
\end{aligned}
$$

Path or functional integral

$$
\begin{gathered}
S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\eta}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \eta+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \eta]\right) \\
+\int d t \tilde{u}\left(\dot{u}+\beta u \not \varlimsup_{\text {response variable }}[I+\alpha u] \eta(\pi, t)\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

## "Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) \\
& +\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)])
\end{aligned}
$$

"Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) \\
& +\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)])
\end{aligned}
$$

Initial data
$-\ln Z_{0}$
"Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) \\
& +\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)])
\end{aligned}
$$

Initial data

$$
S=N\left(\frac{1}{2} \tilde{v} \Delta^{-1} v+\text { nonlinear terms }\right)
$$

"Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) \\
& +\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)])
\end{aligned}
$$

Initial data
$S=N\left(\frac{1}{2} \tilde{v} \Delta^{-1} v+\right.$ nonlinear terms $)$
$\int \mathcal{D} \tilde{v} \mathcal{D} v\left(v^{n} \tilde{v}^{m}\right) e^{-S[v, \tilde{v}]}$
"Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) & \text { Initial data } \\
+\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)]) & -\ln Z_{0}
\end{array}
$$

$$
S=N\left(\frac{1}{2} \tilde{v} \Delta^{-1} v+\text { nonlinear terms }\right)
$$

$\int \mathcal{D} \tilde{v} \mathcal{D} v\left(v^{n} \tilde{v}^{m}\right) e^{-S[v, \tilde{v}]}$
Laplace's method in $1 / N$
"Nonlinear Cole-Hopf Transform" $\eta \rightarrow \psi$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\psi}(\theta, t)\left(\partial_{t} \psi+\partial_{\theta}[(I+\alpha u) \psi]\right) & \text { Initial data } \\
+\int d t \tilde{u}(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u][\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t) \psi(\pi, t)+\psi(\pi, t)]) & -\ln Z_{0}
\end{array}
$$

$$
S=N\left(\frac{1}{2} \overparen{\left.\Delta^{-1} v+\text { nonlinear terms }\right)}\right.
$$

$\int \mathcal{D} \tilde{v} \mathcal{D} v\left(v^{n} \tilde{v}^{m}\right) e^{-S[v, \tilde{v}]} \quad$ Laplace's method in $1 / N$

## Linear Response

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left(\frac{d}{d t}+\beta\right) \Delta_{u}^{u}-\beta \rho(\pi, t) \Delta_{u}^{u}-\beta(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_{\psi}^{u} & =\delta\left(t-t^{\prime}\right) \\
\left(\frac{d}{d t}+\beta\right) \Delta_{u}^{\psi}-\beta \rho(\pi, t) \Delta_{u}^{\psi}-\beta(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_{\psi}^{\psi} & =0 \\
\partial_{t} \Delta_{\psi}^{u}+\partial_{\theta}\left[(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_{\psi}^{u}\right]+\partial_{\theta} \rho \Delta_{u}^{u} & =0 \\
\partial_{t} \Delta_{\psi}^{\psi}+\partial_{\theta}\left[(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_{\psi}^{\psi}\right]+\partial_{\theta} \rho \Delta_{u}^{\psi} & =\frac{1}{N} \delta\left(\theta-\theta^{\prime}\right) \delta\left(t-t^{\prime}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Linear Response



## Linear Response



$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left\langle\delta u(t) \delta u\left(t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \\
& \delta u=u-\bar{u}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Linear Response



$$
\begin{aligned}
& \left\langle\delta u(t) \delta u\left(t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle= \\
& \delta u=u-\bar{u}
\end{aligned}
$$



## Steady state

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{u}=-\beta u+\beta(I+\alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)=0 \\
& \partial_{t} \rho=-\partial_{\theta}[(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \rho] \quad=0 \\
& \bar{\rho}=\frac{1}{2 \pi} \quad \bar{u}=\frac{I}{2 \pi}\left(1-\frac{\alpha}{2 \pi}\right)^{-1} \\
& \nu=(I+\alpha \bar{u}) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Drive Correlations

$$
\left\langle\delta u(t) \delta u\left(t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \quad \delta u=u-\bar{u}
$$

## Drive Correlations

$$
\left\langle\delta u(t) \delta u\left(t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \quad \delta u=u-\bar{u}
$$



## Drive Correlations

$$
\left\langle\delta u(t) \delta u\left(t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \quad \delta u=u-\bar{u}
$$



$$
\begin{aligned}
& =\beta \int d t^{\prime \prime}\left(I+\alpha \bar{u}\left(t^{\prime \prime}\right)\right) \Delta_{u}^{u}\left(t, t^{\prime \prime}\right) \Delta_{u}^{\psi}\left(t^{\prime}, \pi, t^{\prime \prime}\right) \rho\left(\pi, \alpha, t^{\prime \prime}\right)+\left(t \leftrightarrow t^{\prime}\right) \\
& -\frac{N}{(2 \pi)^{2}} \int d \theta \Delta_{u}^{\psi}(t, s) \int d \theta^{\prime} \Delta_{u}^{\psi}\left(t^{\prime}, s^{\prime}\right)+O\left(\frac{1}{N^{2}}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Drive Correlations



## Drive Correlations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left\langle\delta u(t)^{2}\right\rangle= & \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty}\left(1-\frac{1}{2} \delta_{k, 0}\right) \frac{\beta^{2}}{\pi \delta}\left(I+\alpha \bar{u}_{0}\right) \\
& \times e^{-\beta \delta \Delta t_{k}}\left[1-e^{-2 \beta \delta\left(t-t_{0}-\Delta t_{k}\right)}\right] H\left(t-t_{0}-\Delta t_{k}\right) \\
& -\frac{1}{N} \bar{u}_{0}^{2}\left(1-e^{-\beta \delta\left(t-t_{0}\right)}\right)^{2}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Correlation transients




$$
C(t)=\left\langle u(t)^{2}\right\rangle-\langle u(t)\rangle^{2} \propto \frac{1}{N}
$$

## Correlation asymptotic state



## Correlation asymptotic state



## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=
$$



## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=
$$



$$
=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u}) & \left.\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \\
& =\quad \frac{\bar{u}}{N d t}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u}) & \left.\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle \\
& =\quad \frac{\bar{u}}{N d t}
\end{aligned}
$$

Poisson behavior

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

$$
=\quad \frac{\bar{u}}{N d t}
$$

Poisson behavior

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{gathered}
\nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{gathered}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

$$
=\quad \frac{\bar{u}}{N d t} \quad-\quad \frac{\bar{u}^{2}}{N}
$$

Poisson behavior

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \nu(t)=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t) \\
& \langle\nu(t)\rangle=(I(t)+\alpha u(t)) \bar{\rho}=\bar{u}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\left\langle(\nu(t)-\bar{u})\left(\nu\left(t^{\prime}\right)-\bar{u}\right)\right\rangle \quad=(I+\alpha \bar{u})^{2}\left\langle\eta(\pi, t) \eta\left(\pi, t^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle
$$

$$
=\quad \frac{\bar{u}}{N d t} \quad-\quad \frac{\bar{u}^{2}}{N}
$$

Poisson behavior
sampling noise




## Theta Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{\theta}_{i}(t)=1-\cos \theta_{i}(t)+\left(I_{i}(t)+\alpha_{i} u(t)\right)\left(1+\cos \theta_{i}(t)\right) \\
& \dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Theta Model

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \dot{\theta}_{i}(t)=1-\cos \theta_{i}(t)+\left(I_{i}(t)+\alpha_{i} u(t)\right)\left(1+\cos \theta_{i}(t)\right) \\
& \dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right) \\
& S=S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)]+S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)]
\end{aligned}
$$

## Theta Model

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{\theta}_{i}(t)=1-\cos \theta_{i}(t)+\left(I_{i}(t)+\alpha_{i} u(t)\right)\left(1+\cos \theta_{i}(t)\right) \\
\dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right) \\
S=S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)]+S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)] \\
S[\varphi, \tilde{\varphi}]= \\
\quad N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t)\left[\partial_{t} \varphi(\theta, t)+\partial_{\theta}[1-\cos \theta\right. \\
\quad+(1+\cos \theta)\{I+\alpha u(t)\} \varphi(\theta, t)]]-\ln Z\left[\tilde{\varphi}_{0}\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)\right]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Theta Model

$$
\begin{gathered}
\dot{\theta}_{i}(t)=1-\cos \theta_{i}(t)+\left(I_{i}(t)+\alpha_{i} u(t)\right)\left(1+\cos \theta_{i}(t)\right) \\
\dot{u}_{i}+\beta u_{i}=\frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta\left(t-t_{j}^{s}\right) \\
S=S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)]+S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)] \\
S[\varphi, \tilde{\varphi}]=N \int d t d \theta \tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t)\left[\partial_{t} \varphi(\theta, t)+\partial_{\theta}[1-\cos \theta\right. \\
\\
\quad+(1+\cos \theta)\{I+\alpha u(t)\} \varphi(\theta, t)]]-\ln Z\left[\tilde{\varphi}_{0}\left(\theta, t_{0}\right)\right] \\
S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)]=\int_{t_{0}}^{t} d s \tilde{u}(s)\left(\frac{d}{d s} u(s)+\beta u(s)\right. \\
-2 \beta\{\tilde{\varphi}(\pi, s) \varphi(\pi, s)+\varphi(\pi, s)\})-\ln Z\left[\tilde{u}\left(t_{0}\right)\right]
\end{gathered}
$$

## Steady state

$$
\begin{aligned}
\rho_{0}(\theta) & =\frac{\sqrt{I+u_{0}}}{\pi\left(1-\cos \theta+\left(I+\alpha u_{0}\right)(1+\cos \theta)\right)} \\
u_{0} & =\sqrt{I+\alpha u_{0}} \\
\nu & =\frac{1}{\pi} \sqrt{I+\alpha u_{0}}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Steady state

$$
\rho_{0}(\theta)=\frac{\sqrt{I+u_{0}}}{\pi\left(1-\cos \theta+\left(I+\alpha u_{0}\right)(1+\cos \theta)\right)}
$$

$$
u_{0}=\sqrt{I+\alpha u_{0}}
$$

$\rho_{0}$

$$
\nu=\frac{1}{\pi} \sqrt{I+\alpha u_{0}}
$$


$-\pi$
$\pi$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\langle\nu(t)\rangle=2 \rho(\pi, t)
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =2 \rho(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =\int d \alpha d \Omega d \alpha^{\prime} d \Omega^{\prime}\left\langle\psi\left(x_{\pi}\right) \psi\left(x_{\pi}^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle+\frac{1}{N d t}\langle\nu(t)\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =2 \rho(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =\int d \alpha d \Omega d \alpha^{\prime} d \Omega^{\prime}\left\langle\psi\left(x_{\pi}\right) \psi\left(x_{\pi}^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle+\frac{1}{N d t}\langle\nu(t)\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =2 \rho(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =\int d \alpha d \Omega d \alpha^{\prime} d \Omega^{\prime}\left\langle\psi\left(x_{\pi}\right) \psi\left(x_{\pi}^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle+\frac{1}{N d t}\langle\nu(t)\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

Anomalous finite size effects

## Firing rate fluctuations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =2 \rho(\pi, t) \\
\langle\nu(t)\rangle & =\int d \alpha d \Omega d \alpha^{\prime} d \Omega^{\prime}\left\langle\psi\left(x_{\pi}\right) \psi\left(x_{\pi}^{\prime}\right)\right\rangle+\frac{1}{N d t}\langle\nu(t)\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

Anomalous finite size effects
not in phase model

## Simulations



## Simulations



## Simulations




## $\mathrm{N}=10$


$N=10$

## Slides on sciencehouse.wordpress.com

