Beyond mean field theory for neural networks

Michael Buice, Carson Chow









Need to pick a battleground



10¹⁵ connections

neurons are complex

NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF NEUROLOGICAL DISORDERS AND STROKE

Brain Basics

How do you get complex behavior (e.g. thinking) from the collective action of simple elements (e.g. point neurons)?

Function vs Mechanism

How does the brain do X?

e.g. learning, memory, classification

How is X generated in the brain?

e.g. oscillations, synchrony, persistent activity

Neuron



Neuron



$$C\frac{dV}{dt} = -\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_r(x_r)(V - v_r)$$

$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$

Neuron





$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$







$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$









$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$





$$C\frac{dV_i}{dt} = -\sum_{r=1}^n g_r(x_i^r)(V_i - v_r) + \sum_{j=i}^N g_{ij}s_j(t)$$

100





$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$





$$C\frac{dV_{i}}{dt} = -\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_{r}(x_{i}^{r})(V_{i} - v_{r}) + \sum_{j=i}^{N} g_{ij}s_{j}(t)$$

100





$$\tau_r \frac{dx_r}{dt} = f(x, V) - x_r$$



$$C\frac{dV_i}{dt} = -\sum_{r=1}^{n} g_r(x_i^r)(V_i - v_r) + \sum_{j=i}^{N} g_{ij}s_j(t)$$

Really hard



















Microscopic → Macroscopic





Microscopic → Macroscopic





mmm

month and the second se

Microscopic → Macroscopic





mmm

Microscopic → Macroscopic





mmm

• • •

Microscopic → Macroscopic





mmmmm

mean field theory

Microscopic → Macroscopic





mean field theory

Microscopic → Macroscopic

variance $\propto N^{-1}$

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

"activity"

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$



$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

$$\dot{a}_{i}(t) = -\alpha a_{i}(t) + f(\sum_{j} w_{ij}a_{j}(t) + I_{i})$$
gain function
$$f$$
Input

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

connection weights

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$



$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$
$$\dot{a}_i(t) = -\alpha a_i(t) + f(\sum_j w_{ij}a_j(t) + I_i)$$

purely phenomenological Want to derive from neurons

Brain as a map from inputs I to outputs a



Brain as a map from inputs I to outputs a



Brain as a map from inputs I to outputs a



Example learning rules

$$\tau \dot{w}_{ij} = a_i a_j - w_{ij}$$

Hebbian rule

Example learning rules

$$\tau \dot{w}_{ij} = a_i a_j - w_{ij}$$

Hebbian rule

$$\tau \dot{w}_{ij} = C_{ij} - w_{ij}$$
 Correlation rule

Example learning rules

$$\tau \dot{w}_{ij} = a_i a_j - w_{ij}$$
 Hebbian rule

$$au \dot{w}_{ij} = C_{ij} - w_{ij}$$
 Correlation rule

but activity equations ignore correlations

Correlations

Poisson



Synchronized

time

"Generalized" activity equations

$$\dot{a}_{i}(t) = -\alpha a_{i}(t) + f(\sum_{j} w_{ij}a_{j}(t) + I_{i}) + G[C_{ij}]$$

$$\dot{C}_{ij}(t) = \psi[C_{ij}, a_i, a_j]$$

Compute C_{ij} from neurons















$$\frac{dv}{dt} = I + v^2$$

$$\longrightarrow v = \tan(\theta/2)$$

$$\frac{d\theta}{dt} = 1 - \cos\theta + I(1 + \cos\theta)$$

Quadratic integrate-and-fire











$$\frac{dv}{dt} = I + v^2$$

 $v = \tan(\theta/2)$

 $\frac{d\theta}{dt} = 1 - \cos\theta + I(1 + \cos\theta)$

Theta model

Quadratic integrate-and-fire

Simple phase
$$\frac{d\theta}{dt} = \frac{1}{2}$$
model $\frac{d\theta}{dt} = \frac{1}{2}$

Neuron model with coupling

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\theta) + \alpha_i u(t)$$

$$\dot{u}_i + \beta u_i = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_j w_{ij} \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

Neuron model with coupling

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\theta) + \alpha_i u(t)$$

$$\dot{u}_{i} + \beta u_{i} = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} w_{ij} \delta(t - t_{j}^{s})$$

$$\uparrow$$
spike times of neuron j

Neuron model with coupling

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\theta) + \alpha_i u(t)$$

$$\dot{u}_{i} + \beta u_{i} = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} w_{ij} \delta(t - t_{j}^{s})$$
spike times of neuron j

Global coupling: w_{ij} = const





$$C(t,t') = \langle (u(t) - \bar{u})(u(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle$$



$$C(t,t') = \langle (u(t) - \bar{u})(u(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle$$



$$C(t,t') = \langle (u(t) - \bar{u})(u(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle$$

Kinetic theory







Joule



Boltzmann

Kinetic theory

Derive macroscopic equations from microscopic dynamics

Kinetic theory

Derive macroscopic equations from microscopic dynamics

microscopic \rightarrow probabilistic \rightarrow activity













$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\vec{\theta}, t)$$
 $\vec{\theta} = \{\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_N\}$

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\vec{\theta}, t)$$
 $\vec{\theta} = \{\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_N\}$

Probability conservation

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\vec{\theta}, t)$$
 $\vec{\theta} = \{\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_N\}$

Probability conservation

$$\frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

$$\dot{\theta}_i = f_i(\vec{\theta}, t)$$
 $\vec{\theta} = \{\theta_1, \theta_2, \dots, \theta_N\}$

Probability conservation

$$\frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

(Einstein summation convention)
















$$P_k(\theta_1, \cdots, \theta_k) = \int \prod_{i=k+1}^N d\theta_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

$$P_k(\theta_1, \cdots, \theta_k) = \int \prod_{i=k+1}^N d\theta_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

Exchangeability

$$P_k(\theta_1, \cdots, \theta_k) = \int \prod_{i=k+1}^N d\theta_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

Exchangeability $P_N(\cdots, \theta_i, \cdots, \theta_j, \cdots)$

$$P_k(\theta_1, \cdots, \theta_k) = \int \prod_{i=k+1}^N d\theta_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

Exchangeability



$$P_k(\theta_1, \cdots, \theta_k) = \int \prod_{i=k+1}^N d\theta_i P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

Exchangeability



$$P_1(\theta_1) = P_1(\theta_2) = \cdots = P_1(\theta)$$

$$\frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i(\vec{\theta}) P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

$$\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d\theta_i \ \frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i(\vec{\theta}) P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

$$\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d\theta_i \ \frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i(\vec{\theta}) P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

For pairwise interactions, e.g.
$$f_i(\vec{\theta}) = \sum_{j=1}^N f(\theta_i, \theta_j)$$

$$\int \prod_{i=2}^{N} d\theta_i \ \frac{\partial P_N(\vec{\theta})}{\partial t} = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta_i} f_i(\vec{\theta}) P_N(\vec{\theta})$$

For pairwise interactions, e.g.
$$f_i(\vec{\theta}) = \sum_{j=1}^N f(\theta_i, \theta_j)$$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} = -N\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta}\int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$P_2(\theta, \theta') = P_1(\theta')P_1(\theta) + \frac{1}{N}C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$P_2(\theta, \theta') = P_1(\theta')P_1(\theta) + \frac{1}{N}C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$P_2(\theta, \theta') = P_1(\theta')P_1(\theta) + \frac{1}{N}C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

Finite size effects

$$P_2(\theta, \theta') = P_1(\theta')P_1(\theta) + \frac{1}{N}C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

Finite size effects

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = 0$$

Mean field theory

$$P_2(\theta, \theta') = P_1(\theta')P_1(\theta) + \frac{1}{N}C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -\frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

Finite size effects

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = 0$$

Mean field theory Vlasov equation

 $\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

C_2 depends on C_3 and so on

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

C_2 depends on C_3 and so on

$N \operatorname{coupled} \operatorname{PDEs}$

$$\frac{\partial P_1(\theta)}{\partial t} + N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') P_1(\theta') P_1(\theta) = -N \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta} \int d\theta' f_i(\theta, \theta') C_2(\theta, \theta')$$

C_2 depends on C_3 and so on

N coupled PDEs Need to truncate

Sunday, May 20, 12



$$P_N(\ldots,\theta_i,\ldots,\theta_j,\ldots)=P_N(\ldots,\theta_j,\ldots,\theta_i,\ldots)$$

Neuron identity is unimportant





Neuron dynamics:

 $\dot{\theta} = I(t) + \alpha u(t)$

Neuron dynamics:

 $\dot{\theta} = I(t) + \alpha u(t)$

Synaptic dynamics:

Neuron dynamics:

 $\dot{\theta} = I(t) + \alpha u(t)$

Synaptic dynamics:

 $\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta \nu$

Neuron dynamics:

 $\dot{\theta} = I(t) + \alpha u(t)$

Synaptic dynamics:

 $\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta \nu$

Firing rate:

Neuron dynamics:

 $\dot{\theta} = I(t) + \alpha u(t)$

Synaptic dynamics:

 $\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta \nu$

Firing rate:

$$\nu = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

Firing rate:
$$\nu = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta(t - t_{j}^{s})$$

$$\eta(\theta, u, t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta(\theta - \theta_i(t))$$

density:

Firing rate:
$$\nu = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta(t - t_{j}^{s})$$

density:
$$\eta(\theta, u, t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta(\theta - \theta_i(t))$$

$$\delta(t - t_j^s) = \dot{\theta}\delta(\pi - \theta(t))$$

Firing rate:
$$\nu = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_{j} \delta(t - t_{j}^{s})$$

density:
$$\eta(\theta, u, t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \delta(\theta - \theta_i(t))$$

$$\delta(t - t_j^s) = \dot{\theta}\delta(\pi - \theta(t))$$

$$\nu(t) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i} \dot{\theta}_i(t) \delta(\pi - \theta_i(t)) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta(\pi, t)$$

Klimontovich formalism

e.g. Hildebrand, Buice, Chow, PRL 98.054101, 2007

Complete description of system

$$\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta \nu$$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$

Klimontovich formalism

e.g. Hildebrand, Buice, Chow, PRL 98.054101, 2007

Complete description of system $\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta \nu$$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$

but η is not differentiable



θ


θ

















 $\dot{u}(t) = -\beta u(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right]$

 $\langle \dot{u}(t) = -\beta u(t) + \beta [I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta] \rangle$

 $\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

 $\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] = 0$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\left\langle \partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] = 0 \right\rangle$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta\right]\right) = 0$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta\right]\right) = 0$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left\langle \eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] \right) = 0 \right\rangle$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left\langle \begin{array}{l} \eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] \right) = 0 \\ \langle \eta u\eta \rangle \end{array} \right.$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left\langle \begin{array}{l} \eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] \right) = 0 \\ \langle \eta u\eta \rangle \end{array} \right.$$

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left\langle \begin{array}{l} \eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] \right) = 0 \end{array} \right\rangle \\ \left\langle \eta u\eta \right\rangle \end{array}$$

BBGKY moment hierarchy

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \left[I(t)\rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right]$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[I(t) \rho + \alpha \langle u\eta \rangle \right] = 0$$

$$\left\langle \begin{array}{l} \eta \left(\partial_t u(t) + \beta u(t) - \beta \left[I(t)\eta + \alpha u\eta \right] \right) = 0 \\ \langle \eta u\eta \rangle \end{array} \right.$$

BBGKY moment hierarchy

$$\langle u\eta\rangle = u_0\rho + \frac{1}{N}C_{uv}$$

$$\langle u\eta\rangle = u_0\rho + \frac{1}{N} \int_{uv}^{uv}$$

$$\langle u\eta\rangle = u_0\rho + \frac{1}{N} \mathcal{O}_{uv}$$

Ignore correlations

Mean field theory

$$\langle u\eta\rangle = u_0\rho + \frac{1}{N}C_{uv}$$

Ignore correlations

Mean field theory

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \nu(t)$$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u_0(t))\rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u_0(t))\rho \right] = 0$$

Mean field theory

$$\dot{u}_0(t) = -\beta u_0(t) + \beta \nu(t)$$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u_0(t))\rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u_0(t)) \rho \right] = 0$$

Previous work went straight to mean field theory

e.g. Desai and Zwanzig, 1978; Strogatz and Mirollo, 1990; Treves 1993; Abbott and Van Vreeswijk, 1993; ...

Steady state

 $\dot{u} = -\beta u + \beta (I + \alpha u)\rho(\pi, t) = 0$ $\partial_t \rho = -\partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \rho \right]$ = 0

Steady state

$$\dot{u} = -\beta u + \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) = 0$$
$$\partial_t \rho = -\partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \rho \right] = 0$$

$$\bar{\rho} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \qquad \bar{u} = \frac{I}{2\pi} \left(1 - \frac{\alpha}{2\pi} \right)^{-1}$$

Steady state

$$\dot{u} = -\beta u + \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) = 0$$
$$\partial_t \rho = -\partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \rho \right] = 0$$

$$\bar{\rho} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \qquad \bar{u} = \frac{I}{2\pi} \left(1 - \frac{\alpha}{2\pi} \right)^{-1}$$

$$\nu = (I + \alpha \bar{u})\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

 $\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho_0 \left(\pi - It - \alpha \int_0^t u(s) ds \right)$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho_0 \left(\pi - It - \alpha \int_0^t u(s) ds \right)$$

$$|\mathbf{f} \quad \rho_0 = \frac{1}{2\pi}$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$$

 $\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta (I + \alpha u(t))\rho(\theta, t)) = \rho_0(\theta)\delta(t)$

 $\dot{u} + \beta u =$

If
$$\rho_0 = \frac{1}{2\pi}$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = F(I + \alpha u)$$
 $F(x) = \frac{\beta}{2\pi}x$

If
$$\rho_0 = \frac{1}{2\pi}$$
Activity equation

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t)$$

 $\partial_t \rho + \partial_\theta (I + \alpha u(t))\rho(\theta, t)) = \rho_0(\theta)\delta(t)$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u = F(I + \alpha u)$$

$$F(x) = \frac{\beta}{2\pi}x$$

Wilson-Cowan equation

If
$$\rho_0 = \frac{1}{2\pi}$$

Beyond mean field theory

Need a scheme to compute moments of η

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich





e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville



e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich



Ensemble of initial data

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

Liouville

Klimontovich



Ensemble of initial data

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007



Ensemble of initial data \Rightarrow Ensemble of systems

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007



Ensemble of initial data



Ensemble of initial data \Rightarrow Density of densities

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

 $\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$

 $\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u)\eta(\pi, t) = 0$

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

$$\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$$
$$\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) = 0$$

 $\eta(\theta, t_0) = \eta_0(\theta)$

$$\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) = 0$$

$$\eta(\theta, t_0) = \eta_0(\theta) \quad u(t_0) = u_0$$

$$\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] = 0$$

$$\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) = 0$$

$$\eta(\theta, t_0) = \eta_0(\theta) \quad u(t_0) = u_0$$

$$\begin{aligned} \partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] &= 0 \\ \dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) &= 0 \\ \eta(\theta, t_0) &= \eta_0(\theta) \quad u(t_0) = u_0 \end{aligned} \right\}$$

$$\mathcal{L}(u,\eta|u_0,\eta_0)=0$$

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

$$\begin{aligned} \partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] &= 0 \\ \dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) &= 0 \\ \eta(\theta, t_0) &= \eta_0(\theta) \quad u(t_0) = u_0 \end{aligned} \right\} \qquad \mathcal{L}$$

$$\mathcal{L}(u,\eta|u_0,\eta_0)=0$$

 $P[u,\eta|u_0,\eta_0] \propto \delta[\mathcal{L}]$

e.g. Buice and Chow, PRE, 76.031118, 2007

$$\begin{aligned} \partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \eta \right] &= 0 \\ \dot{u} + \beta u - \beta (I + \alpha u) \eta(\pi, t) &= 0 \\ \eta(\theta, t_0) &= \eta_0(\theta) \quad u(t_0) = u_0 \end{aligned} \right\} \qquad \mathcal{L}(u, t_0) \leq u(t_0) \leq u_0$$

$$\mathcal{L}(u,\eta|u_0,\eta_0)=0$$

 $P[u, \eta | u_0, \eta_0] \propto \delta[\mathcal{L}]$ Density of the density



$$\delta(x) = \int e^{ikx} dk$$

$$P[u,\eta] = \delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D}\tilde{u}\mathcal{D}\tilde{\eta} \, e^{-S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}]}$$

$$\begin{split} \delta(x) &= \int e^{ikx} dk & \text{Action} \\ P[u,\eta] &= \delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} \, e^{-S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}]} \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} \delta(x) &= \int e^{ikx} dk & \text{Action} \\ P[u,\eta] &= \delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} \, e^{-S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}]} \end{split}$$

Path or functional integral

$$\begin{split} \delta(x) &= \int e^{ikx} dk & \text{Action} \\ P[u,\eta] &= \delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} \, e^{-S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}]} \end{split}$$

Path or functional integral

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \eta, \tilde{\eta}] = N \int dt d\theta \, \tilde{\eta}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta \left[(I + \alpha u) \eta \right] \right)$$

$$+\int dt\,\tilde{u}\left(\dot{u}+\beta u-\beta[I+\alpha u]\eta(\pi,t)\right)$$
$$\begin{split} \delta(x) &= \int e^{ikx} dk & \text{Action} \\ P[u,\eta] &= \delta[\mathcal{L}] \propto \int \mathcal{D} \tilde{u} \mathcal{D} \tilde{\eta} \, e^{-S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}]} \end{split}$$

Path or functional integral

$$\begin{split} S[u,\tilde{u},\eta,\tilde{\eta}] &= N \int dt d\theta \, \tilde{\eta}(\theta,t) \left(\partial_t \eta + \partial_\theta [(I+\alpha u)\eta] \right) \\ &+ \int dt \, \tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I+\alpha u] \eta(\pi,t) \right) \\ & \text{response variable} \end{split}$$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right)$$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Initial data} \\ \downarrow \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right) & -\ln Z_0 \end{array}$$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Initial data} \\ \downarrow \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right) & -\ln Z_0 \end{array}$$

$$S = N\left(\frac{1}{2}\tilde{v}\Delta^{-1}v + \text{nonlinear terms}\right)$$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Initial data} \\ \downarrow \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right) & -\ln Z_0 \end{array}$$

$$S = N\left(\frac{1}{2}\tilde{v}\Delta^{-1}v + \text{nonlinear terms}\right)$$

$$\int \mathcal{D}\tilde{v}\mathcal{D}v \left(v^n \tilde{v}^m\right) e^{-S[v,\tilde{v}]}$$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Initial data} \\ \downarrow \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right) & -\ln Z_0 \end{array}$$

$$S = N\left(\frac{1}{2}\tilde{v}\Delta^{-1}v + \text{nonlinear terms}\right)$$

$$\int \mathcal{D}\tilde{v}\mathcal{D}v (v^n \tilde{v}^m) e^{-S[v,\tilde{v}]}$$
 Laplace's method in $1/N$

$$S[u, \tilde{u}, \psi, \tilde{\psi}] = N \int dt d\theta \,\tilde{\psi}(\theta, t) \left(\partial_t \psi + \partial_\theta [(I + \alpha u)\psi]\right) \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Initial data} \\ \downarrow \\ + \int dt \,\tilde{u} \left(\dot{u} + \beta u - \beta [I + \alpha u] [\tilde{\psi}(\pi, t)\psi(\pi, t) + \psi(\pi, t)]\right) & -\ln Z_0 \end{array}$$

$$S = N\left(\frac{1}{2}\tilde{v}\Delta^{-1}v + \text{nonlinear terms}\right)$$

$$\int \mathcal{D}\tilde{v}\mathcal{D}v\,(v^n\tilde{v}^m)e^{-S[v,\tilde{v}]} \qquad \text{Laplace's method in } 1/N$$

Linear Response

$$\begin{pmatrix} \frac{d}{dt} + \beta \end{pmatrix} \Delta_u^u - \beta \rho(\pi, t) \Delta_u^u - \beta (I + \alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_\psi^u = \delta(t - t') \begin{pmatrix} \frac{d}{dt} + \beta \end{pmatrix} \Delta_u^\psi - \beta \rho(\pi, t) \Delta_u^\psi - \beta (I + \alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_\psi^\psi = 0 \partial_t \Delta_\psi^u + \partial_\theta \left[(I + \alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_\psi^u \right] + \partial_\theta \rho \Delta_u^u = 0 \partial_t \Delta_\psi^\psi + \partial_\theta \left[(I + \alpha \bar{u}) \Delta_\psi^\psi \right] + \partial_\theta \rho \Delta_u^\psi = \frac{1}{N} \delta(\theta - \theta') \delta(t - t')$$

Linear Response



Linear Response



$$\langle \delta u(t) \delta u(t') \rangle$$

$$\delta u = u - \bar{u}$$



Steady state

$$\dot{u} = -\beta u + \beta (I + \alpha u) \rho(\pi, t) = 0$$
$$\partial_t \rho = -\partial_\theta \left[(I(t) + \alpha u(t)) \rho \right] = 0$$

$$\bar{\rho} = \frac{1}{2\pi} \qquad \bar{u} = \frac{I}{2\pi} \left(1 - \frac{\alpha}{2\pi} \right)^{-1}$$

$$\nu = (I + \alpha \bar{u})\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

 $\langle \delta u(t) \delta u(t') \rangle \qquad \delta u = u - \bar{u}$

$$\langle \delta u(t) \delta u(t') \rangle \qquad \delta u = u - \bar{u}$$



$$\langle \delta u(t) \delta u(t') \rangle \qquad \delta u = u - \bar{u}$$



$$= \beta \int dt'' \left(I + \alpha \bar{u}(t'')\right) \Delta_u^u(t, t'') \Delta_u^\psi(t', \pi, t'') \rho(\pi, \alpha, t'') + (t \leftrightarrow t') \\ - \frac{N}{(2\pi)^2} \int d\theta \, \Delta_u^\psi(t, s) \int d\theta' \Delta_u^\psi(t', s') + O\left(\frac{1}{N^2}\right)$$



$$\langle \delta u(t)^2 \rangle = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \left(1 - \frac{1}{2} \delta_{k,0} \right) \frac{\beta^2}{\pi \delta} \left(I + \alpha \bar{u}_0 \right)$$

$$\times e^{-\beta \delta \Delta t_k} \left[1 - e^{-2\beta \delta (t - t_0 - \Delta t_k)} \right] H(t - t_0 - \Delta t_k)$$

$$- \frac{1}{N} \bar{u}_0^2 \left(1 - e^{-\beta \delta (t - t_0)} \right)^2$$

Correlation transients



 $C(t) = \langle u(t)^2 \rangle - \langle u(t) \rangle^2 \propto \frac{1}{N}$

Correlation asymptotic state



C(t)

Correlation asymptotic state



Sunday, May 20, 12

C(t)

$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$ $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$

 $\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle$

$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$ $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle =$$

$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$ $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$



$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$ $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$



 $= \left(I + \alpha \bar{u}\right)^2 \left\langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \right\rangle$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$

$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$ $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$

 $\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$
$$= \frac{\bar{u}}{Ndt}$$

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$
$$= \frac{\bar{u}}{Ndt}$$

Poisson behavior

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$
$$= \frac{\bar{u}}{Ndt} -$$

Poisson behavior

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$
$$= \frac{\bar{u}}{Ndt} - \frac{\bar{u}^2}{N}$$

Poisson behavior

$$\nu(t) = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\eta(\pi, t)$$
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = (I(t) + \alpha u(t))\bar{\rho} = \bar{u}$$

$$\langle (\nu(t) - \bar{u}) (\nu(t') - \bar{u}) \rangle = (I + \alpha \bar{u})^2 \langle \eta(\pi, t) \eta(\pi, t') \rangle$$
$$= \frac{\bar{u}}{N dt} - \frac{\bar{u}^2}{N}$$

Poisson behavior sampling noise







Deviation from Poisson

Theta Model

$$\dot{\theta}_i(t) = 1 - \cos \theta_i(t) + (I_i(t) + \alpha_i u(t))(1 + \cos \theta_i(t))$$

$$\dot{u}_i + \beta u_i = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_j \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

Theta Model

$$\dot{\theta}_i(t) = 1 - \cos \theta_i(t) + (I_i(t) + \alpha_i u(t))(1 + \cos \theta_i(t))$$

$$\dot{u}_i + \beta u_i = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_j \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

$$S = S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)] + S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)]$$
Theta Model

$$\dot{\theta}_i(t) = 1 - \cos \theta_i(t) + (I_i(t) + \alpha_i u(t))(1 + \cos \theta_i(t))$$

$$\dot{u}_i + \beta u_i = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_j \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

 $S = S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)] + S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)]$

$$S[\varphi, \tilde{\varphi}] = N \int dt d\theta \, \tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t) \left[\partial_t \varphi(\theta, t) + \partial_\theta \left[1 - \cos \theta \right] \right] \\ + (1 + \cos \theta) \left\{ I + \alpha u(t) \right\} \varphi(\theta, t) \left[- \ln Z[\tilde{\varphi}_0(\theta, t_0)] \right]$$

Theta Model

$$\dot{\theta}_i(t) = 1 - \cos \theta_i(t) + (I_i(t) + \alpha_i u(t))(1 + \cos \theta_i(t))$$

$$\dot{u}_i + \beta u_i = \frac{\beta}{N} \sum_j \delta(t - t_j^s)$$

 $S = S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)] + S[\tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t), \varphi(\theta, t)]$

$$S[\varphi, \tilde{\varphi}] = N \int dt d\theta \, \tilde{\varphi}(\theta, t) \left[\partial_t \varphi(\theta, t) + \partial_\theta \left[1 - \cos \theta \right] \right] \\ + (1 + \cos \theta) \left\{ I + \alpha u(t) \right\} \varphi(\theta, t) \left[- \ln Z[\tilde{\varphi}_0(\theta, t_0)] \right] \right\}$$

$$S[\tilde{u}(t), u(t)] = \int_{t_0}^t ds \, \tilde{u}(s) \left(\frac{d}{ds} u(s) + \beta u(s) -2\beta \left\{ \tilde{\varphi}(\pi, s) \varphi(\pi, s) + \varphi(\pi, s) \right\} \right) - \ln Z[\tilde{u}(t_0)]$$

$$\rho_0(\theta) = \frac{\sqrt{I + u_0}}{\pi (1 - \cos \theta + (I + \alpha u_0)(1 + \cos \theta))}$$

$$u_0 = \sqrt{I + \alpha u_0}$$

$$\nu = \frac{1}{\pi}\sqrt{I + \alpha u_0}$$

$$\rho_0(\theta) = \frac{\sqrt{I + u_0}}{\pi (1 - \cos \theta + (I + \alpha u_0)(1 + \cos \theta))}$$

$$u_0 = \sqrt{I + \alpha u_0}$$

$$\nu = \frac{1}{\pi}\sqrt{I + \alpha u_0}$$



 $-\pi$ π

Firing rate fluctuations

 $\langle \nu(t) \rangle = 2\rho(\pi, t)$

Firing rate fluctuations

$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = 2\rho(\pi, t)$$

$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = \int d\alpha d\Omega d\alpha' d\Omega' \langle \psi(x_{\pi}) \psi(x'_{\pi}) \rangle + \frac{1}{Ndt} \langle \nu(t) \rangle$$

Firing rate fluctuations



Firing rate fluctuations
$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = 2\rho(\pi, t)$$
Poisson

$$\downarrow$$

$$\langle \nu(t) \rangle = \int d\alpha d\Omega d\alpha' d\Omega' \langle \psi(x_{\pi})\psi(x'_{\pi}) \rangle + \frac{1}{Ndt} \langle \nu(t) \rangle$$

Anomalous finite size effects

$$\begin{aligned} & \left\langle \nu(t) \right\rangle = 2\rho(\pi, t) \\ & \left\langle \nu(t) \right\rangle = 2\rho(\pi, t) \end{aligned} \qquad \begin{array}{l} \text{Poisson} \\ & \downarrow \\ & \left\langle \nu(t) \right\rangle = \int d\alpha d\Omega d\alpha' d\Omega' \langle \psi(x_{\pi})\psi(x'_{\pi}) \rangle + \frac{1}{Ndt} \langle \nu(t) \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Anomalous finite size effects

not in phase model

Simulations



Simulations



Simulations







N=10

Slides on sciencehouse.wordpress.com